The second gear of the Manchin-Schumer bill

Whenever there’s a tax/spending bill passed by Congress, the Congressional Budget Office “scores” the bill with respect to its impact on deficits, debt and GDP. The guts of the CBO process require dynamic scoring models that estimate the tax impact of every provision in the bill, and everyone sees the detailed results. While the Manchin-Schumer bill would accelerate the US energy transition, there was no CBO-style analysis released by the bill’s principal authors to support the assertion of a 40% decline in GHG emissions by the year 2030. Such analyses reportedly exist; the questions on the next page are what I would ask about them.

To be clear, the stated target entails a 30% decline in emissions from 2021 since 2030 targets typically use 2005 as a reference point. The Manchin-Schumer bill is mostly focused on tax credits to incentivize decarbonization; less is dedicated to more challenging siting, scale, geological, chemical, policy and regulatory obstacles we discussed in this year’s energy piece. My best guess is that the bill would shift the US renewable transition from first to second gear, but that the GHG decline by 2030 would be nowhere near the 40% decline cited.

There may be a separate bill coming this fall (negotiated by Manchin as a quid pro quo) to simplify permitting and siting issues. I will believe it when I see it given the history of judiciary decisions reaffirming state’s rights and rejecting Federal eminent domain assertions. But if this siting bill materializes, combined with provisions Manchin has required for oil/gas development, battery and rare earth supply chain development and passage of the CHIPS bill, Democrats will have constructed a new industrial policy, something which seemed out of reach a few weeks ago. I wish I knew how much it is all really going to cost.

1 $52 billion for US semiconductor R&D, $24 billion for US semiconductor plant tax credits, $200 billion in science and technology research funding
What we need to know to assess the 2030 GHG target

- What percentage of new car sales and what percentage of the total fleet would be electrified by 2030 given the new incentives?[^2]
- What kind of gasoline savings are assumed for HEVs, given how sensitive outcomes are to driver behavior?[^3]
- The bill contains provisions requiring that rising shares of EV battery components and rare earth metals be sourced in the US or its allies by 2024 in order for buyers to be eligible for the $7,500 tax credit at point of sale. These provisions could dramatically reduce the availability of the EV tax credit unless there is a complete and unprecedented shift in related manufacturing processes from China back to the US[^4]
- What is the assumed penetration of sustainable aviation fuels and hydrogen/battery long-haul trucks by 2030? Both of these technologies do not exist yet in any meaningful way[^5]
- What kind of heat pump penetration is assumed to result by 2030 compared to current levels? Will homeowners retain backup thermal systems for very cold days or not?[^6]
- How much more quickly can wind and solar power really be built compared to current levels? For the last few years, new US wind/solar capacity has increased its share of US electricity generation by ~1.2% per year. Grid interconnection challenges and interstate transmission siting (see our energy paper this year) are more binding as constraints than a lack of capital or cost of capital. Btw, China reliance is massive here as well[^7]
- What kind of grid expansion is assumed to take place to accommodate more electrification of transportation and winter heating? For the last decade, the grid has only been expanding at 0.5%-1.0% per year, and most decarbonization plans with 40% assumed GHG reductions require 5%-8% annual grid expansion
- Press articles mention incentives for geothermal. How much is geothermal assumed to contribute in 2030? Today it’s a rounding error, accounting for just 0.1% of US primary energy consumption
- What is assumed by 2030 regarding the amount of US CO₂ emissions that are geologically sequestered, used for enhanced oil recovery or converted into fuels? Are tax credits ranging from $60 to $85 per ton of CO₂ enough to cover capital, maintenance and return requirements? Based on currently operating CCS facilities plus those planned and permitted, just 1%-2% of US emissions are on track to be sequestered in 2030

[^2]: JP Morgan’s Commodity Research Team models oil demand using automaker commitments that 25%-50% of sales will be EVs by 2030, up from 9% in 2021 and 12% in June 2022 (these figures include HEVs with very small batteries charged only by regenerative braking). Even if these EV sales targets are met, given current vehicle average lives of 12 years, only 1 out of 6 passenger cars in the US fleet would be electrified by 2030

[^3]: The most recent data we have seen cite 20%-30% declines in lifecycle GHG emissions for HEV and PHEV vehicles based on actual driver behaviors. This compares to 65%-80% GHG declines for battery electric vehicles

[^4]: According to the bill: the “critical mineral” minimum percentage for US/FTA countries is 40% for 2024, 50% in 2024, 60% in 2025, 70% in 2026, and 80% beyond that. For battery components: 50% in 2024, 60% in 2025, 70% in 2026, 80% in 2027, 90% in 2028, and 100% thereafter. Current US/FTA shares for battery components and critical minerals are in single digits

[^5]: In 2019, US sustainable aviation fuel production (from plants, agricultural waste, sewage, cooking oil) was just 3 million gallons out of 26 billion gallons of jet fuel consumed. On hydrogen trucks: start with 1 kWh of green electricity from wind/solar. By the time this energy is converted into hydrogen via electrolysis and converted by a fuel cell back into electricity to power the truck’s motor, around 70%-75% of the original energy is lost

[^6]: Currently, just 6% of US residential space heating is produced by heat pumps. As discussed in this year’s energy paper, if heat pumps replace on-site combustion of fossil fuels without backup thermal power, generation capacity and transmission would have to be built for the handful of coldest days when electrified heating would skyrocket, creating load demand which could double vs current levels. There are a lot of policy issues to tackle before assuming seamless electrification of residential and commercial winter heating.

[^7]: China makes 97% of solar wafers, 85% of solar cells, 79% of polysilicon and 75% of solar panels
• What kind of continued improvements in energy efficiency per unit of GDP are assumed for 2030, given greater incentives for home improvement and insulation?¹⁸
• Does any serious person really believe that advanced nuclear or direct air carbon capture⁹ will have a material impact on US GHG emission declines by 2030?

**Bottom line.** The Manchin-Schumer bill would accelerate the renewable transition and be the most aggressive climate action taken to date by Congress. It certainly will enrich and sustain a lot of business models in the renewable energy space that are reliant on subsidies; many of them are rallying already. But let’s not delude ourselves about the pace or the high cost of this transition¹⁰, or delude ourselves about the need for a lot of natural gas along the way. The US already faces unprecedented challenges regarding its electricity grid, and any steps that reduce dispatchable power such as natural gas could lead to “disastrous results”.¹¹ I have not even addressed the US natural gas expansion required to rescue Europe from its energy disaster; European natural gas and electricity prices are 5x-7x higher than US levels, which is nothing short of terrifying from an economic and political perspective.

### The US-Europe natural gas gap
Wholesale natural gas price, US$ per MMBTU

![Chart showing US and Europe natural gas prices](chart1)


### The US-Europe electricity gap
Wholesale electricity price, US$/MWh, 7 day average

![Chart showing US and Europe electricity prices](chart2)


---

¹⁸ US energy intensity per unit of GDP has declined by almost 30% since the year 2005 due to more efficient machines, turbines, motors, buildings etc. However, over that same time frame, overall exajoules of energy use are roughly constant given rising energy demand which offsets improving efficiency.

¹⁹ Some highly profitable technology companies are price-inelastic when it comes to a zero carbon footprint, and are reportedly paying $1,200 per ton to startups that capture miniscule amounts of carbon from ambient air. This is irrelevant in the big picture: direct air carbon capture is “an energetically and financially costly distraction in effective mitigation of climate changes at a meaningful scale” [“Unrealistic energy and materials requirement for direct air capture in deep mitigation pathways”, Chatterjee and Huang, Nature Communications, 2020]

¹⁰ Example: if wind developers pay “prevailing wages” and include enough domestic manufacturing content, the subsidy they receive rises by 10x from $0.03 per kWh to $0.31 per kWh. Same kind of provisions for solar subsidies. It does not take a lot of analysis to see that this could quickly become a substantial source of inflation when assessing the true economic cost of wind and solar power.

IMPORTANT INFORMATION
This report uses rigorous security protocols for selected data sourced from Chase credit and debit card transactions to ensure all information is kept confidential and secure. All selected data is highly aggregated and all unique identifiable information, including names, account numbers, addresses, dates of birth, and Social Security Numbers, is removed from the data before the report’s author receives it. The data in this report is not representative of Chase’s overall credit and debit cardholder population.

The views, opinions and estimates expressed herein constitute Michael Cembalest’s judgment based on current market conditions and are subject to change without notice. Information herein may differ from those expressed by other areas of J.P. Morgan. This information in no way constitutes J.P. Morgan Research and should not be treated as such.

The views contained herein are not to be taken as advice or a recommendation to buy or sell any investment in any jurisdiction, nor is it a commitment from J.P. Morgan or any of its subsidiaries to participate in any of the transactions mentioned herein. Any forecasts, figures, opinions or investment techniques and strategies set out are for information purposes only, based on certain assumptions and current market conditions and are subject to change without prior notice. All information presented herein is considered to be accurate at the time of production. This material does not contain sufficient information to support an investment decision and it should not be relied upon by you in evaluating the merits of investing in any securities or products. In addition, users should make an independent assessment of the legal, regulatory, tax, credit and accounting implications and determine, together with their own professional advisers, if any investment mentioned herein is believed to be suitable to their personal goals. Investors should ensure that they obtain all available relevant information before making any investment. It should be noted that investment involves risks, the value of investments and the income from them may fluctuate in accordance with market conditions and taxation agreements and investors may not get back the full amount invested. Both past performance and yields are not reliable indicators of current and future results.

Non-affiliated entities mentioned are for informational purposes only and should not be construed as an endorsement or sponsorship of J.P. Morgan Chase & Co. or its affiliates.

For J.P. Morgan Asset Management Clients:
J.P. Morgan Asset Management is the brand for the asset management business of JPMorgan Chase & Co. and its affiliates worldwide.

To the extent permitted by applicable law, we may record telephone calls and monitor electronic communications to comply with our legal and regulatory obligations and internal policies. Personal data will be collected, stored and processed by J.P. Morgan Asset Management in accordance with our privacy policies at https://am.jpmorgan.com/global/privacy.

ACCESSIBILITY
For U.S. only: If you are a person with a disability and need additional support in viewing the material, please call us at 1-800-343-1113 for assistance.

This communication is issued by the following entities:
In the United States, by J.P. Morgan Investment Management Inc. or J.P. Morgan Alternative Asset Management, Inc., both regulated by the Securities and Exchange Commission; in Latin America, for intended recipients’ use only, by local J.P. Morgan entities, as the case may be.; in Canada, for institutional clients’ use only, by JPMorgan Asset Management (Canada) Inc., which is a registered Portfolio Manager and Exempt Market Dealer in all Canadian provinces and territories except the Yukon and is also registered as an Investment Fund Manager in British Columbia, Ontario, Quebec and Newfoundland and Labrador. In the United Kingdom, by JPMorgan Asset Management (UK) Limited, which is authorized and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority; in other European jurisdictions, by JPMorgan Asset Management (Europe) S.à r.l. in Asia Pacific (“APAC”), by the following issuing entities and in the respective jurisdictions in which they are primarily regulated: JPMorgan Asset Management (Asia Pacific) Limited, or JPMorgan Funds (Asia) Limited, or JPMorgan Asset Management Real Assets (Asia) Limited, each of which is regulated by the Securities and Futures Commission of Hong Kong; JPMorgan Asset Management (Singapore) Limited (Co. Reg. No. 197601586K), which this advertisement or publication has not been reviewed by the Monetary Authority of Singapore; JPMorgan Asset Management (Taiwan) Limited; JPMorgan Asset Management (Japan) Limited, which is a member of the Investment Trusts Association, Japan, the Japan Investment Advisers Association, Type II Financial Instruments Firms and the Japan Securities Dealers Association and is regulated by the Financial Services Agency (registration number “Kanto Local Finance Bureau (Financial Instruments Firm) No. 330”); in Australia, to wholesale clients only as defined in section 761A and 761G of the Corporations Act 2001 (Commonwealth), by JPMorgan Asset Management (Australia) Limited (ABN 55143832080) (AFSL 376919). For all other markets in APAC, to intended recipients only.

For J.P. Morgan Private Bank Clients:

ACCESSIBILITY
J.P. Morgan is committed to making our products and services accessible to meet the financial services needs of all our clients. Please direct any accessibility issues to the Private Bank Client Service Center at 1-866-265-1727.

LEGAL ENTITY, BRAND & REGULATORY INFORMATION
In the United States, bank deposit accounts and related services, such as checking, savings and bank lending, are offered by JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A. Member FDIC.

JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A. and its affiliates (collectively “JPMC”) offer investment products, which may include bank-managed investment accounts and custody, as part of its trust and fiduciary services. Other investment products and services, such as brokerage and advisory accounts, are offered through J.P. Morgan Securities LLC (“JPM”) and J.P. Morgan Securities LLC (“JPM”), a member of FINRA and SIPC. Annuities are made available through Chase Insurance Agency, Inc. (CIA), a licensed insurance agency, doing business as Chase Insurance Agency Services, Inc. in Florida. JPMCB, JPM and CIA are affiliated companies under the common control of JPM. Products not available in all states.

In Germany, this material is issued by J.P. Morgan SE, with its registered office at Taunustor 1 (TaunusTurm), 60310 Frankfurt am Main, Germany, authorized by the Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht (BaFin) and jointly supervised by the BaFin, the German Central Bank (Deutsche Bundesbank) and the European Central Bank (ECB). In Luxembourg, this material is issued by J.P. Morgan SE — Luxembourg Branch, with registered office at European Bank and Business Centre, 6 route de Treves, L-2633, Senningerberg, Luxembourg, authorized by the Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht (BaFin) and jointly supervised by the BaFin, the German Central Bank (Deutsche Bundesbank) and the European Central Bank (ECB); J.P. Morgan SE — Luxembourg Branch is also supervised by the Commission de Surveillance du Secteur Financier (CSSF); registered under R.C.S Luxembourg B255938. In the United Kingdom, this material is issued by J.P. Morgan SE — London Branch, registered office at 25 Bank Street, Canary Wharf, London E14 5JP, authorized by the Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht (BaFin) and jointly supervised by the BaFin, the German Central Bank (Deutsche Bundesbank) and the European Central Bank (ECB); J.P. Morgan SE — London Branch is also supervised by the Financial Conduct Authority and Prudential Regulation Authority. In Spain, this material is
distributed by J.P. Morgan SE, Sucursal en España, with registered office at Paseo de la Castellana, 31, 28046 Madrid, Spain, authorized by the Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht (BaFin) and jointly supervised by the BaFin, the German Central Bank (Deutsche Bundesbank) and the European Central Bank (ECB); J.P. Morgan SE, Sucursal en España is also supervised by the Spanish Securities Market Commission (CNMV); registered with Bank of Spain as a branch of J.P. Morgan SE under code 1567.

In Italy, this material is distributed by J.P. Morgan SE – Milan Branch, with its registered office at Via Cordusio, n.3, Milan 20123, Italy, authorized by the Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht (BaFin) and jointly supervised by the BaFin, the German Central Bank (Deutsche Bundesbank) and the European Central Bank (ECB); J.P. Morgan SE – Milan Branch is also supervised by Bank of Italy and the Commissione Nazionale per le Società e la Borsa (CONSOB); registered with Bank of Italy as a branch of J.P. Morgan SE under code 8076; Milan Chamber of Commerce Registered Number: REA MI 2536325.

In the Netherlands, this material is distributed by J.P. Morgan SE – Amsterdam Branch, with registered office at World Trade Centre, Tower B, Stawinskaans 1135, 1077 XX, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, authorized by the Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht (BaFin) and jointly supervised by the BaFin, the German Central Bank (Deutsche Bundesbank) and the European Central Bank (ECB); J.P. Morgan SE – Amsterdam Branch is also supervised by De Nederlandsche Bank (DNB) and the Autoriteit Financi ë le Markten (AFM) in the Netherlands. Registered with the Kamer van Koophandel as a branch of J.P. Morgan SE under registration number 72610220.

In Denmark, this material is distributed by J.P. Morgan SE – Copenhagen Branch, filial of J.P. Morgan SE, Tyskland, with registered office at Kalvebod Brygge 39-41, 1560 København V, Denmark, authorized by the Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht (BaFin) and jointly supervised by the BaFin, the German Central Bank (Deutsche Bundesbank) and the European Central Bank (ECB); J.P. Morgan SE – Copenhagen Branch, filial af J.P. Morgan SE, Tyskland is also supervised by Finanstilsynet (Danish FSA) and is registered with Finanstilsynet as a branch of J.P. Morgan SE under code 29010.

In Sweden, this material is distributed by J.P. Morgan SE – Stockholm Bankfilial, with registered office at Hamngatan 15, Stockholm, 11147, Sweden, authorized by the Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht (BaFin) and jointly supervised by the BaFin, the German Central Bank (Deutsche Bundesbank) and the European Central Bank (ECB); J.P. Morgan SE – Stockholm Bankfilial is also supervised by Finansinspektionen (Swedish FSA); registered with Finansinspektionen as a branch of J.P. Morgan SE. In France, this material is distributed by JPMCB, Paris branch, which is regulated by the French banking authorities Autorité de Contrôle Prudentiel et de Résolution and Autorité des Marchés Financiers. In Switzerland, this material is distributed by J.P. Morgan (Suisse) SA, with registered address at rue de la Confédération, 8, 1211, Geneva, Switzerland, which is authorised and supervised by the Swiss Financial Market Supervisory Authority (FINMA), as a bank and a securities dealer in Switzerland. Please consult the following link to obtain information regarding J.P. Morgan’s EMEA data protection policy: https://www.jpmorgan.com/privacy.

In Hong Kong, this material is distributed by JPMCB, Hong Kong branch. JPMCB, Hong Kong branch is regulated by the Hong Kong Monetary Authority and the Securities and Futures Commission of Hong Kong. In Hong Kong, we will cease to use your personal data for our marketing purposes without charge if you so request. In Singapore, this material is distributed by JPMCB, Singapore branch. JPMCB, Singapore branch is regulated by the Monetary Authority of Singapore.

Dealing and advisory services and discretionary investment management services are provided to you by JPMCB, Hong Kong/Singapore branch (as notified to you). Banking and custody services are provided to you by JPMCB Singapore Branch. The contents of this document have not been reviewed by any regulatory authority in Hong Kong, Singapore or any other jurisdictions. You are advised to exercise caution in relation to this document. If you are in any doubt about any of the contents of this document, you should obtain independent professional advice. For materials which constitute product advertisement under the Securities and Futures Act and the Financial Advisers Act, this advertisement has not been reviewed by the Monetary Authority of Singapore. JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A. is a national banking association chartered under the laws of the United States, and as a body corporate, its shareholder’s liability is limited.

With respect to countries in Latin America, the distribution of this material may be restricted in certain jurisdictions. We may offer and/or sell to you securities or other financial instruments which may not be registered under, and are not the subject of a public offering under, the securities or other financial regulatory laws of your home country. Such securities or instruments are offered and/or sold to you on a private basis only. Any communication by us to you regarding such securities or instruments, including without limitation the delivery of a prospectus, term sheet or other offering document, is not intended by us as an offer to sell or a solicitation of an offer to buy any securities or instruments in any jurisdiction in which such an offer or a solicitation is unlawful. Furthermore, such securities or instruments may be subject to certain regulatory and/or contractual restrictions on subsequent transfer by you, and you are solely responsible for ascertaining and complying with such restrictions. To the extent this content makes reference to a fund, the Fund may not be publicly offered in any Latin American country, without previous registration of such fund’s securities in compliance with the laws of the corresponding jurisdiction. Public offering of any security, including the shares of the Fund, without previous registration at Brazilian Securities and Exchange Commission—CVM is completely prohibited. Some products or services contained in the materials might not be currently provided by the Brazilian and Mexican platforms.

JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A. (JPMCBNA) (ABN 43 074 112 011/AFS Licence No: 238367) is regulated by the Australian Securities and Investment Commission and the Australian Prudential Regulation Authority. Material provided by JPMCBNA in Australia is to “wholesale clients” only. For the purposes of this paragraph the term “wholesale client” has the meaning given in section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001 (Cth). Please inform us if you are not a Wholesale Client now or if you cease to be a Wholesale Client at any time in the future.

JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A. (JPMCBNA) (ABN 43 074 112 011/AFS Licence No: 238367) is regulated by the Australian Securities and Investment Commission and the Australian Prudential Regulation Authority. Material provided by JPMCBNA in Australia is to “wholesale clients” only. For the purposes of this paragraph the term “wholesale client” has the meaning given in section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001 (Cth). Please inform us if you are not a Wholesale Client now or if you cease to be a Wholesale Client at any time in the future.

This material has not been prepared specifically for Australian investors. It:

- May contain references to dollar amounts which are not Australian dollars;
- May contain financial information which is not prepared in accordance with Australian law or practices;
- May not address risks associated with investment in foreign currency denominated investments; and
- Does not address Australian tax issues.